Minutes Baltimore County Landmarks Preservation Commission January 10, 2008 Meeting

Mr. James E. Matthews, Chairman, opened the regular monthly meeting of the Baltimore County Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) at 6:00 p.m. The following Commission members were:

Present Not Present

Mr. James E. Matthews, Chairman

Ms. Carol Allen

Mr. C. Bruce Boswell

Mr. Louis S. Diggs

Dr. Robert Gregory

Ms. Nancy W. Horst

Ms. Nancy M. Hubers

Ms. Wendy McIver

Mr. Thomas L. Reynolds

Ms. Norma Secoura

Mr. Qutub K. Syed

Mr. David Bryan

Mr. John W. Hill. Vice Chairman

Ms. Gloria K. McJilton

County staff present included Karin Brown (Chief for Preservation Services), Teri Rising (Preservation Services staff) and Vicki Nevy (Secretary to the Commission) and Jeff Long (Deputy Director for the Office of Planning).

Annual election of Chairman and Vice-Chairman

1. Mr. Matthews stated that the annual election of officers was at hand. Having advised the Commission in December of his intention to resign from the position of Chairman, he asked for nominations for the position of Chairman and Vice-Chairman. Ms. Horst moved to elect Mr. Hill as Chairman and Mr. Boswell as Vice-Chairman. Both Mr. Hill and Mr. Boswell had let it be known they would agree to serve if nominated. Ms. Allen seconded the motion, which was approved unanimously on a voice vote. Mr. Matthews agreed to chair the evening's meeting in Mr. Hill's absence.

Review of the Agenda

2. Ms. Brown advised the Commission that she received a request to consider removing agenda items 11 and 12 from the consent agenda to be discussed in due course. Additionally, she noted that the attorney representing Stansbury Manor,

asked that the public hearing scheduled for February 14, 2008, be tabled and that Ms. Allen wished to make an announcement . Mr. Boswell moved to approve the removal of items 11 and 12 from the consent agenda to allow for discussion. Mr. Syed seconded the motion, which was passed unanimously on a voice vote.

Approval of the Minutes

3. Mr. Matthews asked if anyone had any changes to be made to the Minutes and after hearing none, Mr. Diggs moved to approve the November 8, 2007 Minutes as submitted. Dr. Gregory seconded the motion, which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

Consent Agenda

4. Mr. Matthews asked Ms. Brown to describe the item scheduled on the Consent Agenda and determined that no person present objected to the approval as submitted. Mr. Diggs moved that, for the reasons stated, and in accordance with the conditions stated in the written Action Summaries provided to the members of the Commission by staff, item 10 be approved as submitted. Ms. Horst seconded the motion, which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

Public Hearings on Nominations to the Landmarks List

8. "Lapenna residence" and setting, 110 Forest Avenue, Catonsville; County Inventory #CI-3283; third party nomination for structure planned to be demolished as part of a development project [County Council District #1]

This item concerned a third party nomination for a structure planned to be demolished as part of a development project. Preservation Services also received a demolition permit request for the structure. The discussion of the item was taken out of agenda order to accommodate Mr. Syed's schedule. Ms. Rising read staff's recommendation to issue a notice to proceed with the demolition of the property. Mr. Syed reported that the technical committee consisting of himself, Mr. Hill and Mr. Matthews agreed the structure was in very bad condition and did not meet the criteria for landmarking. All agreed they would not object to the demolition. The structure has been vacant for a long period of time and shows signs of both interior and exterior water penetration. He further reported several additions of no architectural significance have been made to the structure over time. The committee also noted the condition of two secondary structures located on the property. One has completely collapsed and the other is significantly leaning to the side. Mr. Syed moved to issue a notice to proceed with the demolition of the structure. Dr. Gregory seconded the motion.

Mr. Dino LaFiandra stated he is representing the developers of the property and asked the Commission to note the letter in their binder from Mr. Tim Dugan, former Chief of Preservation Services, dated January 6, 2006. The letter explained the circumstances leading to the withdrawal of the nomination in 2006, because due to the existing house was not being the original structure built on the lot, but rather a newer dwelling that was not historic.

On behalf of the developers, architect Larry Link shared his evaluation of the existing structure indicating it was not a distinctive style and had been modified many times.

Dr. Gregory asked Mr. LaFiandra to offer details with regard to the Concept Plan dated 2/27/07 provided to the Commission. Mr. LaFiandra indicated the Concept Plan was a PUD approved by the Planning Board for an age restricted housing community and that the developers had worked extensively with the community at-large.

Mr. Matthews then called upon those having signed in to speak which included Mr. Stephen Lackey, Ms. Marcia White Wise, Ms. Ruth Mascari and Mr. Dan Rosen. Mr. Lackey, who had submitted the nomination, explained he has lived in the neighborhood since the late 1960's. He described the atypical construction methods used by Mr. Bloede, the original owner in order to make the building fire-resistant. Mr. Syed wondered why Mr. Lackey had waited until now to nominate the building if he lived next door since the 1960's.

Ms. White Wise spokes of Mr. Bloede's professional achievements and his contributions to the Catonsville community.

Ms. Mascari reviewed an outline of Mr. Bloede's accomplishments.

Ms. Allen asked to see all of the pictures taken at the time of the technical committee's site visit. Mr. Syed answered questions raised by other commissioners noting the poor structural conditions reflected in the pictures and the lack of architectural features present.

Mr. Dan Rosen proposed an alternative concept plan for the development that would allow the home to remain intact.

Mr. Matthews reminded those in attendance that the purpose of the hearing was only to consider the historic significance of the house and reminded the commissioner's that there was a motion on the floor to issue a notice to proceed with the demolition of the house.

The motion failed with a roll call vote of three votes in support of the motion and seven against the motion.

5. "Bunting House," 17028 Old York Road, Monkton; County Inventory CI-903 (MIHP #BA-903); request for demolition [County Council District # 3]

This item concerned an owner's request for demolition of a property on the County Inventory. Ms. Rising read the recommendation from the Action Summaries to issue a notice to proceed. Mr. Matthews called upon those who had signed in to speak regarding this matter. Mr. Albert Young, representing the owner of the property, indicated he was available should there be any questions.

Ms. Allen reported on her visit to the property with Mr. Hill and Ms. Rising. She believed the property's inclusion on the inventory to have been a mistake because the house had been constructed in 1973 and thus was less then fifty years old.

Mr. Boswell moved to issue a certificate of appropriateness for the demolition of the house. Mr. Diggs seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

6. "Greenspring Punch Stone House" and setting, 2031 Greenspring Valley Road, County Inventory #CI-1613 (MIHP #BA-1613); owner nomination [County Council District # 2]

This item concerned an owner's nomination to the Landmarks List and a request to demolish a non-historic frame addition to the structure. Ms. Rising read the recommendation from the Action Summaries to vote to (a) place the "Greenspring Punch Stone House" on the Preliminary Landmarks List under criteria (1) – for its association with the historically significant area of the Greenspring Valley; for its association with the significant Cockey, Owings & Stevenson families (2) – as an excellent example of early stone vernacular construction (b) to delineate the part of the property containing the building, 0.49 acres total, (map 68, parcel 14) as its historic environmental setting. (c) Vote to issue a notice to proceed with the demolition of the non-historic frame addition. Mr. Reynolds moved to accept staff's recommendations. Ms. Horst seconded the motion.

Mr. Carroll, the owner of the property, addressed the Commission with regard to limiting the historic environmental setting to 0.49 acres rather than delineating the entire site.

Mr. Boswell reported on the results of the site visit and discussed the character of the valley being defined by open areas. Mr. Boswell therefore felt the historic environmental setting should cover the entire parcel of 3.15 acres.

The motion passed with nay votes being cast by both Mr. Boswell and Ms. McIver.

7. "Lystra Meadows," (barn and corn crib on Levy property) 10808 Greenspring Avenue, Greenspring Valley (MIHP #BA-1669B); request to table the nomination [County Council District # 2]

This item concerned a third party nomination in response to a demolition attempt. Ms. Rising read the recommendation from the Action Summaries to table the nomination. Mr. Matthews advised the Commission that if the matter were tabled, they could hear testimony on the matter, but, would not be able to discuss the subject.

The attorney for the current owner of the property, Mr. Dino LaFiandra, informed the Commission that although his client opposes the nomination, the owner is currently negotiating the sale of the property. It is Mr. LaFiandra's understanding that the potential buyer of the property would not oppose the nomination. Mr. LaFiandra's client requested a postponement of the evening's hearing so that she would not have to argue against the nomination. He reported the contract purchaser had no issue with a postponement.

Mr. Diggs moved to table consideration of the nomination until the February 14, 2008 meeting. Mr. Boswell seconded the motion.

After much discussion of the pros and cons of a postponement, Mr. Matthews called for a vote on the motion made by Mr. Diggs to table the nomination. The motion passed unanimously by a voice vote.

Mr. Matthews then asked it anyone attending the evening's meeting wished to speak rather than waiting until February's meeting. Mr. Doug Carroll addressed the Commission pointing out the property is very unique in that it is one of only five such properties in Baltimore County. He further reminded the Commission that four years ago the property was placed on the Preliminary Landmarks List.

9. "Claggett-Schmidt House & Store," 9101-9105 Liberty Road, Randallstown; County Inventory # CI-3077 (MIHP #BA-3077); request for demolition [County Council District # 4]

This item concerned a demolition request for two structures with a County Inventory number. Ms. Rising read the recommendation from the Action Summaries to vote to issue a notice to proceed. Mr. Diggs and Ms. Allen reported on the findings of the technical committee. Mr. Diggs moved to issue a notice to proceed with the demolition of both structures. Ms. Allen seconded the motion, which passed with one nay vote cast by Ms. Secoura.

Alteration to properties in County Historic Districts or Landmark structures

10. Stellmann property, 1008 Windsor Road, Sudbrook Park County Historic District; rear fence installation [County Council District #2]

This item concerned a request by the owners to install a split rail fence in a portion of their back yard located in a County Historic District.

Approved via the consent agenda to issue a notice to proceed.

Applications for Tax Credit

Request for LPC approval for a County Part II Tax Credit application

11. Sullivan property, 608 Hatherleigh Road; contributing structure in the Stoneleigh National Register District; reconfiguration of interior floor plan in master bed-room and work associated with that reconfiguration. [County Council District # 5]

Mr. Matthews requested that both County Part II Tax Credit applications be discussed for the purpose of comparing rehabilitation projects to remodeling projects. Ms. Allen recused herself from the discussion because she lives in the neighborhood both where properties are located.

Ms. Brown explained the details of the work being proposed in the tax credit applications for items number 11 and 12. In both cases, a state application was not submitted because the state differentiates between remodeling and rehabilitation projects. Remodeling projects are not considered by the state. The county tax credit program does not differentiate between the two types of work.

The Commission decided to consider adding language to the County law that would make projects that are basically remodeling jobs, ineligible. After the discussion, Dr. Gregory moved to approve the tax credit application for agenda items 11 and 12. Mr. Diggs seconded the motion, which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

12. Kirby property, 6903 Marlborough Road; contributing structure in the Stoneleigh National Register District; reconfiguration of interior floor plan – creation of new master bedroom and master bath room. [County Council District # 5]

See item number 11.

Report on County Tax Credit applications approved

Ms. Brown noted that tax credit applications had been approved for the Olszewski property in Dundalk, the Frazier property and Collamer properties in Stoneleigh, the Floyd-Coffay property in Sudbrook Park and the Stoke property in Summit Park because the applicants had submitted signed/approved Part 2 State Tax Credit applications.

Other Business

Mr. Boswell reviewed the Subcommittee's report on Economic Hardship and moved to accept the report. Ms. McIver seconded the motion, which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

Ms. Brown reviewed the material provided entitled "Law And The Historic Preservation Commission: What Every Member Needs To Know," noting that the article considered ex parte communication inappropriate behavior unless such conversation are disclosed at the Commission meetings. Additionally, the article stressed the importance of coming to the meetings prepared, i.e. that Commission members should read the materials sent to them prior to the meeting.

Ms. Brown informed the LPC that the provision in Bill 26-07 which removes structures from the County Inventory if the County Council declines Final Landmarks listing, is retroactive. She cited the Lystra Meadow's barn as an example of a structure that was removed from the County Inventory retroactively because the County Council declined placing the structure on the Final Landmarks List four years ago.

Ms. Brown relayed a request by the attorney for Stansbury Manor to postpone the public hearing scheduled for February 14, 2008. The attorney indicated that the owners would prefer the public hearing to be scheduled for the March 13, 2008 meeting, because they will be out of town in February. Mr. Reynolds moved to table the public hearing for Stansbury Manor until March 13, 2008. Dr. Gregory seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

Ms. Allen shared an invitation to attend Michael Ambrose's lecture on the architecture of Louis Kahn and Zaha Hadid on January 29, 2008 at the Baltimore Museum of Art.

Ms. Brown reported that four properties had been added to the Final Historical Landmarks List via Bill 91-07.

Dr. Gregory moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Reynolds seconded the motion, which was approved unanimously on a voice vote. The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m..

VKN:vkn